

8550 Hudson Boulevard North
Eagle Point Office Center II, Suite 105
Lake Elmo, MN 55042
(651) 288-8550
foth.com

October 6, 2022

TO: Nicole Miller, City of Saint Anthony Village (City)

CC: Charlie Yunker, City
Filsan Ibrahim, Ramsey County
Cami Van Abel, Foth Infrastructure & Environment, LLC (Foth)
Gabi Romenesko, Foth

FR: Dan Krivit, Foth

RE: Summary of RFP Process and Results To-Date

Introduction

Foth Infrastructure & Environment, LLC (Foth) prepared this memorandum (memo) to summarize the process and results to-date of the City of Saint Anthony Village (City) recent request for proposals (RFP) for Residential Solid Waste and Recycling Services as released on July 1, 2022.¹ Foth is serving the City as the consultant under the Ramsey County Technical Assistance Program (TAP).

The City intends to maintain its basic organized collection structure for contracting solid waste and recycling services. The City also intends to transition from three haulers to a single hauler system through this RFP process. The list of contract services includes, but is not limited to, the following:

- ◆ City-wide, weekly refuse collection service and delivery to a designated disposal facility.
- ◆ City-wide, every-other-week (EOW) recycling collection service and delivery to a materials recovery facility. As an alternate proposal, weekly recycling collection frequency pricing was also requested in this RFP packet.
- ◆ Subscription, weekly seasonal (April through November) yard waste collection service and delivery to a Composting Facility.
- ◆ Ownership and management of all refuse, recycling, and yard waste carts.

¹ The City posted the RFP on its web page dedicated to this project at:
<http://savmn.com/563/Request-for-Proposals> including the schedule and the RFP packet including:
http://savmn.com/DocumentCenter/View/2417/FINAL_SAV_RFP-2022; the Draft Contract:
<http://savmn.com/DocumentCenter/View/2416/Final-DRAFT-Contract-2022>

- ◆ Subscription “on-call” bulky waste collection service and delivery to a disposal facility.
- ◆ Refuse and recycling services from designated City buildings, and park facilities at no charge to the City.
- ◆ Drop-off collection event for annual spring City “Clean-Up Day”.
- ◆ Public education services from the selected hauler
- ◆ Planning for curbside organics recycling.
- ◆ Reporting and data collection as detailed in the RFP “Draft Contract”.
- ◆ Direct customer support services to residents, businesses, City buildings and park facilities.

RFP Process and Schedule

The Draft Contract itemized the City priorities for the new contract in the preamble “whereas” section. Section 2.9 of the RFP detailed the proposal evaluation criteria including:

- ◆ Price schedules
- ◆ Disruption of service
- ◆ Experience and capacity
- ◆ Thoroughness and responsiveness
- ◆ References

The RFP stated that no single criteria will be determinative of the best proposal, and the foregoing list is not inclusive.

Questions from proposers were allowed and answered by the City.² Proposals were due on July 29, 2022.

The City established a “Proposal Review Committee” made up of the following members:

- ◆ Charlie Yunker, City Manager
- ◆ Nicole Miller, Assistant to the City Manager
- ◆ Shelly Rueckert, City Finance Director
- ◆ Jeremy Gumke, City Public Works Director
- ◆ Filsan Ibrahim, Ramsey County Environmental Health Specialist

Results to Date

Two proposals were received by the City: Aspen Waste Systems, Inc. (Aspen) and Walters Recycling and Refuse, Inc. (Walters). Both proposals were deemed to be complete and responsive. The Proposal Review Committee met initially to discuss and carefully evaluate the two proposals. Customized questions were provided by the Proposal Review Committee to

² Questions from Proposers and answers from the City:
<https://www.savmn.com/DocumentCenter/View/2427/Questions-recd-from-haulers>



each proposer and written responses prepared by the proposer were received by August 29, 2022. Individual interviews were then conducted with each proposer on August 30, 2022.

Foth calculated the estimated five-year total costs over the life of the contract based on proposed prices from the two respondents and assumptions in the RFP. Foth also calculated the estimated five-year total costs of the “current contract” prices with the existing group of three haulers. The same assumptions were used for annual inflation adjustments.

Table 1 is a summary comparison of the total cost of services over the five-year contract period of the contract. These costs do not include taxes and environmental fees.

Table 1
Comparison of Five-Year Total Costs

	Aspen	Walters	Current Contract
Refuse	\$1,902,341	\$2,734,215	\$2,387,233
Recycling	\$696,028	\$755,906	\$568,540
Yard Waste	\$612,709	\$935,213	\$556,145
Bulky Waste	\$106,879	\$130,629	\$113,161
Total	\$3,317,957	\$4,555,963	\$3,625,079

Prepared by: GGR
Checked by: DFK

Additional details (e.g., proposed unit prices) are not included in this summary. Pursuant to the RFP, proposals and such related correspondence are confidential until the final contract is executed.

The Proposal Review Committee reviewed all information and carefully evaluated each proposal against the RFP proposal evaluation criteria. Subsequently, the Proposal Review Committee provided a recommendation for the City to move forward to contract negotiations with a selected proposer.